

The public consultation chapter aims to highlight the key consultation and community engagement activities and their outcomes, in addition to outlining the key aspects to be addressed when holding the consultation activities of the (11) site-specific ESIAAs upon final project detailing.

Throughout the various consultation and engagement activities, the work teams experienced and recorded remarkable and overwhelming public acceptance, even eagerness, by the community and the governmental stakeholders towards the proposed project. The indignity and financial hardships experienced by scores of Egyptian families (especially women) in obtaining LPG cylinders (the current household fuel) was revealed through testimonies all over the country. Aside from a limited number of concerns regarding street rehabilitation after construction works and options of installation fee payment; the glaring message from governmental and community consultations was to commence implementation ASAP (with repeated requests to expand coverage beyond what is planned for the project).

Consultation activities (scoping, interviews, focus group discussions, public hearings/consultations) with various stakeholders and community people in the host communities were held for the proposed 1.1 million household NG connections project in compliance with:

- WB policies related to disclosure and public consultation, namely,
 - o World Bank Procedure (BP 17.50)
 - o World Bank Operational Policy (OP 4.01)
- Egyptian regulations related to the public consultation
 - o Law 4/1994 modified by Law 9/2009

7

Objectives of various consultation activities are summarized as follows:

- 1- Define potential project stakeholders and suggest their possible project roles
- 2- Disseminate comprehensive information about the project to enable stakeholders to identify their concerns, needs, and recommendations.
- 3- Document stakeholder feedback and enhance the ESIAF accordingly
- 4- Identify the most effective outreach channels that support continuous dialogue with the community
- 5- Discuss potential resettlement plans and impacts of involuntary resettlement

Defining the stakeholder

Given the fact that the project exact routes and project details have not been finalized at this stage, stakeholder identification was based on analysis of geographical, legal, institutional, and operational scope of the project. The following table represents the stakeholders contacted and engaged for the consultation events:

Table 1 Main stakeholders identified for the Framework

Stakeholder	Role/ concern
Local Governmental entities	
Governorates	The main role of the governorates is the provision of support to the project through mobilizing people to gain information about the project. Media is known to shed light on activities of the governorate entities
Local Governmental units (District authorities and village authorities)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Permissions for the lands needed for PRS should be prepared by the governorate and approved by the LGU. - Rehabilitation of roads, which is one of the major issues raised by the community, will be performed by the LGU.
Other governmental entities	
Information Centers on the governorate level	Provide NG companies with underground utilities and infrastructure maps.
Governmental Authorities	Various authorities in the governorate will support the project through permissions for excavation works, maintenance, health related issues, etc.
The Social Fund for Development	Offers loans in LPG distribution startups.
Egyptian Environmental Affair Agency (HQ and RBOs)	Responsible for reviewing and approving ESIA's, and monitoring implementation of the Environmental Management Plan
Security Department	Secure the construction sites and prevent people from in- flushing into it
Ministry of Health	Providing health facilities to the project workers
Ministry of Tourism	Relevant to project implementation in Touristic Governorates such as Aswan, Qena, Matrouh, and Alexandria.
Ministry of Antiquities	Very important to issue permissions for excavations and accompany the working teams, particularly, in Sohag and Aswan which are rich in monuments.
Media	
Television and radio representatives	Inform the community about the project and its impacts and support dissemination of ESIA studies
Press people	
Websites editors	
NGOs working on environmental and social related aspects	
NGOs on the central level	Play an active role in any awareness-raising related to the project
NGOs on district level	May provide financial support to the poorer customers
Specific union of NGOs	
Universities and Educational institutes	
Faculty of Engineering	Review and enrich the ESIA study with feedback
Secondary vocational schools	Propose needed capacity building for their students to potentially find employment with the project
Researchers/consultants	Review results of the study and provide feedback
Other	
Private companies	Mainly potential tenderers for construction works
Traders	Provide workers with food and amenities.
Contractors	From the project adjacent areas, may be affected.
Community people	
Community leaders	Main cornerstone in mobilizing the communities.
Heads of tribes	In Marsa Matrouh city, provide security to the pipelines. Their approval to allow the project to cross their lands should be obtained during the early stage of the project.
Potential beneficiaries	Potentially benefit from the project

Stakeholder	Role/ concern
Potential Project Affected Persons (PAPs)	Farmers whose lands may be traversed by project components. LPG distributors(formal and informal), LPG storage workers.
Natural Gas companies	
EGAS	Implementing agency overseeing activities of the Environmental and Social Management Plan
Egypt Gas	Local distribution company (LDC) who will implement, operate, and manage the ESMP
Town Gas	Local distribution company (LDC) who will implement, operate, and manage the ESMP
Butagasco	May be affected due to the installation of the NG
Petro trade	They are the responsible entity for collecting the consumption fees and the bank installment

The abovementioned stakeholders were consulted using various tools i.e. Individual interviews, group meetings and public consultation. Most of them have attended the public consultation hearings conducted during December 2013 in the 11 governorates. However, some of them were interviewed in their premises in order to enable them to spell out their concerns and worries freely.

Consultation Methodology and Activities

3441 community members were engaged directly. Consultations were conducted on various levels to outreach all levels of stakeholders.

Public scoping sessions

- Giza and Qalubia Governorates on November 24th of 2013 in Flamenco Hotel.
- Upper Egypt Governorates on November 26th 2013 in Maraga City Hall, Sohag.
- Delta governorates on November 28th 2013 in Menoufia University Hotel.

Participants profile

Participants of the scoping session consultation events represented different categories of stakeholders from the targeted areas. In total, 251 persons attended those sessions, of which 198 were males and 53 were females. The males represented (78.9) % of the total participants, while females represented only (21.1%) This is relatively a high presentation of females comparing to similar projects implemented in the same Governorates.

Diversity in age and educational backgrounds was reflected in participants' contributions and enriched the session with a wide range of opinions. The visits paid to introduce the project to the community were an appropriate aperitif that drove the community people to be more willing to get information about the project. The diversity between literate and illiterates, workers and unemployed enriched the discussion to a



Photo 1: Advertisement published in El Ahram related to the 3 scoping sessions

great extent. A variety of organizations as well as representatives from governmental and community based authorities, institutes, and entities also took part in these scoping session meetings.

- 35.5% from governmental entities
- 17.7% from government environment sector
- NGOs (4.6% in Giza , 15.9% in Menufia and 20.3% in Sohag)
- Five TV, press and Radio reporters attended the 3 scoping meetings.
- Community people (technicians, service sales laborers and teachers)

Summary of discussions

All participants expressed their eagerness for commencement of project implementation without further delay and many participants demanded the extension of the project to additional areas. Following is a summary of all discussions conducted.

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses
LPG cylinder problems	Speeding up the environmental and social studies and permissions so as to launch the construction phase as soon as possible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EcoConServ is preparing the ESIAF study required to obtain EEAA approval. • EGAS is working on obtaining other required permissions
Recommendation to enhance the project performance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EGAS should obtain detailed information about all project areas and develop a report about each area • The installation of NG should be obligatory not optional • EGAS should share infrastructure maps developed for the project with the Local Governmental units • The selection of project areas should be revisited • All towns and cities should be connected 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The exact streets will be defined at a later stage. Thereafter, an ESIAF will be prepared for each governorate • EGAS cannot oblige anyone to have NG installed • All available information will be shared with the Local Governmental Units • Project areas were selected based on certain criteria as presented • This project is one of a series of projects that aim at connecting all houses to NG
Scope of social study	It is important to meet with informal LPG distributors and house guards in the project areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This task is within the scope of ESIAF study
Awareness activities and NGOs roles	Will the project undertake any awareness activities? Local NGOs should be integrated in these activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Awareness activities are among the recommendations of the ESIAF study
Street rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is crucial to study the impacts on streets and the restoration process • Street restoration should not be the responsibility of Local Governmental units 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All impacts will be fully investigated • Restoration alternatives are <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Restoration will be fully undertaken by NG companies (Town Gas – Egypt Gas) or 2. NG companies will pay local governmental units to carry out restoration works
Considering alternative sources of energy	In addition to NG, EGAS should consider also making use of solar energy and biogas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This particular project is limited to NG. However, solar and wind energy projects are being implemented by the New and Renewable Energy Authority on the national level

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses
NG installations for houses constructed with no official permits	It is crucial not to install the NG to illegally constructed houses.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the requirements for installing NG is the provision of an electricity bill. Houses constructed without the necessary permits do not have access to „state electricity” and will not be able to provide the required bills.
NG installation to areas with no sewage system	Areas with no access to a sewage system should not be deprived of NG as well. This is not fair.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NG should be the last facility to be installed. This is mainly due to safety requirements
Vulnerable groups working in LPG distribution	EGAS should consider meeting the poor and marginalized groups working in LPG distribution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vulnerable groups are an essential component of this study. Due attention will be given to them. They will be investigated during the ESIAF
Poor people	EGAS should provide a subsidy enabling the poor to install NG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The NG connection is already subsidized by the state. Thus, it is recommended that other entities step in to provide additional support to the poor
Visual intrusion	The pipelines damage the entrance of houses and diminish the aesthetic value of buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We try to follow the maximum safety procedures while at the same time minimizing damage to houses. Plans to minimize visual intrusion have been developed

Data collection activities

- 44 mini group meetings were conducted in 29 project areas, attended by 263 members of community and governmental entities.
- 36 individual meetings were conducted in the 11 governorates with governmental stakeholders. In addition, 16 individual meetings were conducted with the LPG distributors.
- 1904 Households were consulted in various project areas.
- Dual meetings were conducted with 20 persons in Marsa Matrouh city as households will be provided NG for the first time governorate-wide.
- A leaflet about the project was prepared and uploaded to the website. Thereafter, 1000 leaflets were printed and distributed during the site visits⁸:
 - 1- Brief description of the project
 - 2- Potential impacts of the project
 - 3- Total number of installations

Participants profile

In addition to the above mentioned, mini meetings and individual interviews were conducted in the 11 governorates. The community people on the district level were interviewed. As well as, the health centers' service providers, the LPG distributors, NGOs and Governmental entities. Participants were of a variety of age categories. Young people were motivated to attend the meetings held in their own premises. Females were strongly represented at 26.9% of the participants. Consultations with women took place in homes, LPG storerooms, and NGOs. Some consultation activities were conducted informally. A casual ambiance was adopted during consultations to encourage people to spell out their concerns freely.

⁸ Details are presented in the SIA document (submitted to WB and EGAS in parallel to this report).



Photo 2: Woman interviewed in the NGO



Photo 3: Consultation on the street

Summary of discussions

The discussion addressed/documentated the following:

- 1- Options of poorer customers to receive additional financial support
- 2- Physical and financial burdens of LPG cylinders and dilemmas during shortage
- 3- Corruption related to LPG distributors
- 4- Credible information due to the misconceptions related to NG safety
- 5- Feasibility of connecting NG to rural areas and remote ones
- 6- Importance to integrate community based organizations in awareness activities
- 7- Monitoring and maintenance of the grid
- 8- NG job opportunities for areas adjacent the project
- 9- Cooperation with the LGU throughout the life of the project

Final public consultations

Consultation activities were conducted in the 11 Governorates during the last 10 days of December 2013. Parallel teams implemented the consultation activities.

- Four consultants from EcoConServ (two environmental and two social)
- Eight representatives of EGAS, Town Gas and Egypt Gas
- Four representatives of EEAA accompanied the teams over the 11 governorates
- 2 administrative managers and numerous drivers

Table 2: 11 Consultation activities conducted during the final consultation phase

Governorate	Date	Venue
Aswan	21st of December 2013	Governorate Hall (Arous El Neil)
Menufia	21st of December 2013	Governorate Hall
Qena	23rd of December 2013	Girls Club Hall in Qena city
Giza	23rd of December 2013	Army Hotel Hall
Matrouh	25th of December 2013	Nile centre for Media
Sohag	25th of December 2013	Local Popular Council
Alexandria	26th of December 2013	Mercure Hotel
Daqahlia	29th of December 2013	Marshal Hotel
Gharbeia	29th of December 2013	Panorama Hotel
Qalubia	30th of December 2013	Egypt Public Library in Benha
Ismailia	30th of December 2013	Media Compound in El Sheikh Zaid

The list of invitees was developed by EEAA regional branches, environmental offices of the governorates, NGOs, governmental media centers, and various government employees, in cooperation with the Consultant. Invitees were informed of the date and location of the Public Consultation at least two weeks ahead. Participants were invited through:

- 1- Invitations sent by EGAS via mails, Faxes and e-mails.
- 2- Telephone communication by EGAS and the Consultant.
- 3- An advertisement was published in El Ahram El Mesay followed by a second advertisement published in Aswan Newspaper and El Esboua Newspaper.
- 4- Aswan Newspaper presented a news clip about the project prior to the event.
- 5- A simplified Fact-sheet/brochure in Arabic (500 copies) distributed:: i) Governorates that the project will be implemented in, ii) general description of the project, iii) Potential long and short term impacts of the project .



Photo 4: One of the developed posters

Hearings/consultations were held in adequately situated and equipped venues affiliated to NGOs, Media centers, Governorate, and hotels. In Sohag, Qena, and Aswan minibuses were rented to move people from the remote areas to the public consultation venues.

Participants profile

971 participants attended the 11 final consultation events. Participants reflected different categories of stakeholders from the project targeted areas. Female participation was targeted throughout advertising and invitation process. The highest representation of women was noted in Ismailia Governorate (60.8%) while the least representation of females were found in Matrouh. Taking the unique cultural traits of Matrouh into account, additional mini meetings were conducted with the females on the governmental employees and residents levels. Matrouh as invitations extended to heads of tribe and the NGOs working on the tribal levels.

Overall, special attention was paid to involving young groups and females as they are most affected by the physical hardships of obtaining the LPG cylinders. The physically-challenged were represented in consultation activities through NGOs working with them.

- NGOs represented 14.9% of the participants among which 70.0% of them work on the solid waste management and street afforestation
- 42.0% of the participants represented governmental entities (Local Governmental Units, Road Authority, the Urban planning, etc.)
- Governmental environmental sector represented 15.8% of the total participants (EEAA regional branches, governorate EMU and local environmental units)
- 38.8% of the total participants held administrative jobs
- 26.5% specialists (Lawyers, professors, businessmen, chemists, etc.)
- 23.8% of the total participants were of top managerial positions (government) and heads of municipalities
- Technicians and specialists represented 6.8%
- 2.0% were students.

Summary of discussions

All consultation events started with a summary of the project and the Natural Gas in Egypt. Using PowerPoint and multimedia, representatives of EGAS, Town Gas and Egypt Gas presented detailed information about all project activities.

Using PowerPoint and multimedia, EcoConServ experts presented the ESIAF to the community people. Simple wording was used whenever possible by the environmental and social expert in order to be comprehended by the members of community. The resettlement policy framework was presented as an important element of the final public consultation.



Photo 5: A tribe leader in Matrouh Gov.

Photo 6: Participants in Daqahlia Governorate



Photo 7: Posters in Sohag Governorate.

Photo 8: Consultation event in Sohag Governorate

During breaks, Media interviewed EGAS representatives, government officials, community members, and the consultants. The main issues raised during these interviews were as follow:

- 1- General information about the Natural Gas
- 2- Positive and negative impacts of the NG
- 3- The rules and regulations of EEAA
- 4- The role of stakeholders and community participation

Each session ended with an open discussion lasting for a couple of hours.

Table -3: Key comments and concerns raised during the Final Public Consultations

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses
Damaging underground utilities and infrastructure during digging	Will the implementing agencies avoid damaging the underground utilities/facilities and infrastructure?	All necessary procedures should be carried out to avoid damaging underground utilities/facilities and infrastructure. In case any facilities are damaged, they will be restored

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses
Collaboration with governmental entities and information centers	Many governmental entities (Local Governmental Units, Information centers, Road Authority, Water resource, Mayors...etc.) are willing to cooperate with the project to facilitate work. Will this be possible?	It is crucial to collaborate with these entities in order to obtain information, maps and permissions
Role of community based organization and tribe leaders	It is recommended to cooperate with members of civil society in order to increase awareness	Civil Society members play a major role in carrying out awareness raising activities as well as securing the financial aid to poor people
Role of the Army	EGAS should consult and contribute with the army in the frontier governorates	Their approvals and permissions are key to implementing project activities
Reduction the installation cost	It is recommended to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Take the LPG cylinder as an advance payment for the NG. Thereafter, the poor pay by installment 2. Cooperate with the Ministry of Social Solidarity to reduce the installation cost for poor 3. Mobilize the local community and the NGOs to provide support to poor 	It is difficult to adopt these recommendations
People living with disabilities	At least 5% of jobs provided by EGAS should be filled by people with disabilities	This recommendation will be taken into consideration
Appropriate time for construction	Matrouh, Alexandria and Ismailia are touristic areas. Thus EGAS should avoid working there during summer time	This recommendation will be taken into consideration
Restoration of streets	All attendees voiced their concern about damaging the streets without restoring them after the completion of installation activities due to the bad performance of the Local Governmental Unit (corruption)	Two alternatives of street rehabilitation were investigated: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Restoration will be fully undertaken by NG companies (Town Gas – Egypt Gas)or - NG companies will pay local governmental units to carry out restoration works
Some devices cannot be operated by the NG	We use a baking stove. This will not be operated by the NG. What should we do?	The baking stove can't be connected to the NG for safety purposes
Awareness activities	Awareness activities should cover the following: Contact person in the site (foreman) GRM personnel Hotline for damage and maintenance Website and SMS	This recommendation will be taken into consideration
Job opportunities	The jobs provided by this project should be made available to the local community	It is more economically viable to provide jobs to the local community

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses
Remote areas and suburbs	NG should be installed to remote areas and the suburbs	They will be concerned in later stage
Capacity building	EGAS should raise the capacity of community members in order to enable them to work in the project	This will be investigated and implemented whenever possible
Paying by installment	Does the proposed system for paying by installment contain any interest?	The bank should have their interest rate
Criteria to select certain areas to install the NG	What are the criteria to select the project areas	There are numerous selection criteria based on economic aspects and technical consideration
Safety measures	What are the safety measures followed by the NG companies	We apply the maximum standards of safety (British standards)

Second Public Consultation Disclosure Activities

The importance of the project for the government and the community was reflected in remarkable media coverage. Media covered events and interviewed participants:

- 1- **Newspapers: El Youm 7, El Masry El Youm, El Watan**
- 2- **News websites: El Ahram, El Borsa website, El Shrouk, Aswat Mesria, El Mashad, Misr El Youm**
- 3- **Aswan governorate website, ONA news**
- 4- **Tibah and Canal National TV channels**