



8. Stakeholder Engagement and Public Consultation

The public consultation section aims to highlight the key consultation and community engagement activities that took place as part of the preparation of the ESIA, ESMPs and their outcomes. The new households that will be connected by NG are supplementary to the current existing natural gas connection network in Qalyubia Governorate. ESIA/ESMPs for other districts were prepared, stakeholder engagement and public consultation activities were held, and studies were cleared by the Bank and disclosed on EGAS website. Stakeholder Engagement activities and a series of public consultations were conducted all through the past 5 years since the early stages of the project in December 2013 until recent. In May and July Consultation activities during the preparation of the for the project sites under study in Kafr Shukr and Qaha Districts was conducted. Stakeholders were identified, a work plan was developed, information adequately disclosed, used different engagement instruments. Fair gender based participation and engagement of the different stakeholders and documentation of all conducted events were made. Public concerns were responded to and addressed in the ESIAF /ESIA/ESMPs of the project.

Consultation activities showed an overwhelming acceptance of the consulted participants to host the NG. Their willingness to be connected to the NG, some potential beneficiaries expressed their willingness to pay the installation cost in cash, while others were much in favor to pay in installment. This high level of enthusiasm from the local communities towards the project is attributed to the high level of awareness of the benefits of the natural gas and the current hardships that the households are facing to secure LPG provision and usage.

8.1 Legal framework for consultation

The consultation activities were conducted in full compliance with the following legislations:

- WB policies and directives related to disclosure and public consultation, namely,
 - o Directive and Procedure on Access to Information
 - o World Bank Operational Policy (OP 4.01)
- Egyptian regulations related to public consultation,
- While WB safeguards and regulations state that a minimum of two large-scale, well-publicized public consultation sessions are a must for projects classified as category “A” projects like the one at hand, additional consultation efforts (for example through focus group discussions, in-depth meetings, and interviews) were implemented to reach the most vulnerable and difficult to reach community members.



8.2 Objectives of consultations

Objectives of various consultation activities are summarized as follows:

- 1- Define potential project stakeholders and suggest their possible roles in the project.
- 2- Disseminate comprehensive information about the project to enable stakeholders to identify their concerns, needs, and recommendations.
- 3- Document stakeholder feedback on the defined impacts as well as the social and environmental management plan and enhance the ESMP accordingly
- 4- Identify the most effective outreach channels that support continuous dialogue with the community
- 5- Discuss potential resettlement plans and impacts of involuntary resettlement (in places where this is applicable).

8.3 Defining the stakeholder

In order to ensure an inclusive and meaningful consultation process, a stakeholder's analysis was conducted to get better understanding of the various groups and their roles, interests and influence on the project.

For the purpose of this site specific ESMP, a focused stakeholders' identification shown in Table 8-1, was developed to identify the key groups of relevance to the project in this specific location. The main identified groups are very similar to those identified on the Governorate level but on a smaller scale. Local communities involving both men and women of projects beneficiaries, as well as the PAPs, local NGOs/CDAs, contractors and suppliers were among the key stakeholders on the local level.

Table 8-1: Stakeholders identified in Qalyubia Governorate

Stakeholder Category	Stakeholder Group	Relevance/Importance of the Stakeholder to the Project
Communities in the project sites	Residents of communities within the project sites: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kafr Shukr • Qaha District 	Residents of these communities are more likely to be adversely affected by environmental and social impacts; for example, traffic during construction and other impacts relating to community health and safety. Residents of local communities will also potentially benefit from job opportunities or other positive economic outcomes, particularly; they will have access to the natural gas.
	Residents in other districts in Qalyubia Governorate	Residents of other districts in Qalyubia will benefit from job opportunities available in the project. Additionally, they will benefit from the savings of the LPG cylinders result due to the project implementation



Stakeholder Category	Stakeholder Group	Relevance/Importance of the Stakeholder to the Project
Businesses outside of the Area of Influence Project Workforce (both direct and through subcontractors) Health care providers NGOs and civil society National government stakeholders	Vulnerable groups within the local communities	Vulnerable groups may be likely to be adversely affected by environmental and social impacts, while also being least likely to benefit from the Project. Women, disabled, old people and children might get injured if they crossed the excavated areas in main streets and allies. Children also may fall down in the excavated areas
	Small business owners	Local businesses have the potential to benefit economically from the Project. However, as local residents this group also have the potential to be impacted by any social and environmental risks and impacts (positive and/or negative). For example, the effects of excavation work.
	Suppliers and contractors	They will benefit from any supplies available for the project.
	Project workers	Workers will benefit from available job opportunities in the project. The workforce is fundamental to the Project and a sound worker-management relationship is key for the sustainability of a company.
	Community health care providers Health institutions Health services providers	The Project will secure health facilities to the workers through contracting health facility in Qalyubia to provide required service
	El Shoban El Moslemein, Resala, Misr El Kheir NGO	NGOs might share information about the project: terms of contracting and safety measures of the NG
	Egyptian Environmental Affair Agency	Responsible for reviewing and approving ESIA/ESMPs, and monitoring implementation of the Environmental Management Plan
	Information Centers on the governorate level	Provide NG companies with underground utilities and infrastructure maps.
	Security Department	Secure the construction sites and prevent people from in- flushing into it
	Ministry of Antiquities	Very important to issue permissions for excavations and accompany the working teams,
Ministry of Transportation	This Ministry may have interest in issues relating to transportation and traffic planning related to the Project.	
General Authority for Roads, Bridges and Land Transport	Responsible for permitting related to any road work for the Project (e.g., road cutting)	



Stakeholder Category	Stakeholder Group	Relevance/Importance of the Stakeholder to the Project
Local/provincial government stakeholders	Qalyubia Governorate Authority	They are cooperating with the project in terms of facilitating permissions and coordinating with other local governmental units
	Local Governmental units (District authorities and village authorities)	Rehabilitation of roads, which is one of the major issues raised by the community, will be performed by the LGU. Provision of solid waste management facility
Media	Television and radio representatives Newspaper Websites	Inform the community about the project and its impacts and support dissemination of the main results of the ESIA/ESMP studies
Universities and Educational institutes	Faculty of Engineering	Review and enrich the ESMP study with feedback
	Secondary vocational schools	Propose needed capacity building for their students to potentially find employment with the project
	Researchers/consultants	Review results of the study and provide feedback
Natural Gas companies	EGAS	Implementing agency overseeing activities of the Environmental and Social Management Plan
	Egypt Gas	Local distribution company (LDC) who will implement, operate, and manage the ESMP
	Butagasco	It is the firm responsible for the LPG distribution. They will benefit from the project in terms of reducing the demand on LPG cylinders
	Petro trade	They are the responsible entity for collecting the consumption fees and the bank installment

The abovementioned stakeholders were consulted using various tools (i.e. individual interviews, group meetings and public consultation). Most of the stakeholders have attended the public consultation hearings conducted during December 2013 in the 11 Governorates. However, some of them were interviewed in their premises in order to enable them to spell out their concerns and worries freely.

8.4 Consultation Methodology and Activities

The research team for this study has adopted multi-dimensional consultation activities that enable the marginalized, voiceless, youth and women to gain information about the project. As well as, gaining information about their concerns and worries that regarding the project during various implementation phases. Following are the methodology and the main consultation activities adopted by the research team:



- 1- The study team visited the project district in order to define various stakeholders.
- 2- The study team divided the various engagement activities of the project to:
 - Scoping phase,
 - Data collection phase,
 - Consultation activities and final public consultation.
- 3- The study team has adopted many tools during the consultation process such as:
 - Conducting Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with the local communities.
 - Conducting panel meetings with the governmental officials and potential affected people.
 - Interviews and In-depth discussions
 - Public consultation sessions.
 - Various NGOs participated actively in the preparation of the FGDs and providing data collectors to assist the team in collecting the data.
- 4- Consultation activities have been developed for the different communities through the following phases:
 - a. Phase I: Public Consultation for the framework study 2013. [Annex-11](#)
 - b. Phase II: Consultation activities (2015-2016) and Public Consultation at the governorate level for the ESIA study, February, 2016. [Annex-12](#)
 - c. Phase III: The consultation activities in 2017, **during preparation of ESMP study for 4 Districts (2017)**
 - d. Phase IV: Consultation activities during the preparation of ESMP **study for 2 districts**, May and July, 2018.

All activities conducted were documented with photos and lists of participants in order to warrantee appropriate level of transparency.

Table 8-2: Summary of Consultation Activities in Qalyubia Governorate (2013-2018)

Participants	Number		Methods	Date
	Males	Females		
During the preparation of framework (2013)				
Potential beneficiaries and Government officials Governmental and NGOs	6	8	FGD	December 2013 Data collection
	3	2	In-depth	
Potential beneficiaries	69	206	Structured questionnaire	



Participants	Number		Methods	Date	
	Males	Females			
Potential beneficiaries and government officials, and NGOs	63	8	Public Consultation	29 th December 2013	
Total	141	224			
During the preparation of ESIA for El Khosous PRS, (2015 -2016)					
Potential beneficiaries and government officials	80	78	FGD In depth	September and October 2015	
Governmental and NGOs	12	4	In depth		
Community people	477	727	Structured questionnaire		
Potential beneficiaries, government officials, NGO representatives,	64	19	Public consultation	10 th of February 2016	
During ESMP study for 4 Districts (2017)					
Potential beneficiaries	El Qalag, El Gabal El Asfar	10	7	- FGD -In depth	February and March 2017
	Met Asem	7	6		
	Izbet Afandena	10	8		
Potential beneficiaries	El Qalag, El Gabal El Asfar	10	7	- FGD -In depth	February and March 2017
	Met Asem	7	6		
	Izbet Afandena	10	8		
Potential beneficiaries	El Qalag, El Gabal El Asfar	10	7	- FGD -In depth	February and March 2017
	Met Asem	7	6		
	Izbet Afandena	10	8		
Potential beneficiaries	El Qalag, El Gabal El Asfar	10	7	- FGD -In depth	February and March 2017
	Met Asem	7	6		
	Izbet Afandena	10	8		
Representatives from Egypt Gas and Cairo Gas	Egypt Gas	6		-In depth	
	Cairo Gas	5			
During the preparation of ESMP study for 2 Districts (2018)					
Potential beneficiaries	Qaha	20	7	FGD	
	Kafr Shukr	15	6		



Participants		Number		Methods	Date
		Males	Females		
LPG vendors	Qaha	6	1	In depth	May, and July, 2018
	Kafr Shukr	4	0		
Governmental officials	Qaha	6	3	In-depth	
	Kafr Shukr	5	10		
NGOs	Qaha	1	0	In-depth	
	Kafr Shukr	1	0		



A panel discussion with government officials at Kafr Shukr, LGU headquarters



FGD with community people



FGD with LPG Vendor and Distributers at Kafr Shukr



Figure 8-1: Consultation activities at Kafr Shukr district.



Figure 8-2: FGD with LPG Vendor and Distributers at Qaha district



8.4.1 Summary of consultation activities

Stakeholders' engagement and public consultation activities were conducted in order to ensure that the views and concerns of the local communities are integrated, and guarantee that they are taken into account by the different parties in charge of implementing the project. The views and concerns of local communities are an integral part of the project, and they are to be thoroughly taken into account throughout the different phases of the project.

The field research team engaged in a number of social activities. These activities include focus group discussions with potential beneficiaries; and with potential affected people (LPG vendors), in-depth discussions with government officials, representatives of civil society, and community leaders. A panel meeting was held at the Local Governmental Center in Qalyubia Governorate, where the public officials of Governorate stressed on expediting the implementation of the project in their villages.

Throughout the discussions interviewees were asked about five main points:

- The type of fuels currently in use, and its associated problems
- The upsides and downsides of NG, compared to other types of fuels
- The effects of the project during constructions and operations
- The cost of NG installation to households
- The future positive/negative impact of NG connections project

It was notable that the reactions and attitudes of the local communities towards the project are in favor of the project. The field research team noted a strong public support and eagerness towards the project. Beside some legitimate concerns expressed by the public, the field research team recorded the general view that NG is a far better substitute for the type of fuel currently in use. **Table 8-3** illustrates the different subjects, questions, comments and responses that were discussed throughout the different consultation activities.

Table 8-3: Key comments and concerns raised during the different consultation activities, and the way they were addressed in the ESMP study

Subject	Questions and comments	Responses	Addressed in the ESMP Study
Street Rehabilitation & Land refill	-who is responsible to rehabilitate the street and land refill after the end of construction works?	Egypt Gas responded to this question as they will be the implementing agency responsible for street rehabilitation in terms of budget. However, the LGU will implement the streets rehabilitation according to the street rehabilitation plan.	Section 7. ESM&MP



Subject	Questions and comments	Responses	Addressed in the ESMP Study
The cost of NG installation	<p>-how much is the cost for installing NG to households? -Is there an installment system to settle the installation fee?</p>	<p>The total cost of NG installation is about 7000 EGP. The Government of Egypt pays about 4700 EGP as subsidy to each client. LDCs have agreements with the Egyptian Banks to finance the installation cost for any client, in installment for up to 6 years. AFD in cooperation with EU provide a grant of 1500 EGP for poor people according to illegibility criteria. Moreover, Ministry of Petroleum has announced for new initiative to encourage more people to connect NG by paying the cost in installment for 6 years at zero-interest rate.</p>	<p>Section 4. Environment and Social Baseline.</p> <p>Willingness and affordability to pay</p> <p>And section 5</p> <p>Table 5-2 Impact Assessment</p>
Hotline customer services &	<p>-Is there a hotline or a customer service office to receive customer complaints?</p>	<p>There is a hotline number which is 129 that works 7 days a week for 24 hours. Also there are different channels for the complaints system.</p>	<p>Section 7</p>
Compatibility of home appliances	<p>-Do people have to replace their old home appliances in order to get NG?</p>	<p>The home appliances should be suitable to install the NG. Old appliances might not be suitable to NG installation. Electricity water heater should be replaced by Gas water heater. Additionally, the baking oven will never be connected by NG as the valve is not compatible with the NG.</p>	<p>Section 2</p>



Subject	Questions and comments	Responses	Addressed in the ESMP Study
Clear information	<p>-The gas company needs to provide us with clear information about everything related to NG.</p> <p>-shouldn't the gas company distribute flyers or brochures with clear information about Gas</p>	<p>The LDC adopts multi-level of information sharing. The first level through the contracting office. Posters are installed there to share information about the NG and contracting procedures. The second level is during the P& A survey where technicians share information about contracting and NG. Additionally, there is a hotline that can share information with any of the targeted beneficiary</p>	Sections 7, 8
Eligibility for connecting to an area	<p>Why all areas are not connected with NG</p>	<p>There are some technical and economic criteria's to connect the area by NG</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - First all infrastructure should be available in the area especially sewage system - The area should be crowded and suffer from LPG problems - The area should be near to the national NG network - Detailed technical specifications will be informed to all beneficiaries through the hotline 	Section 2
Loses of income for LPG Vendors	<p>The NG connection project will affect the source of income for LPG vendors and the distributors (السريحة)</p>	<p>NG is not going to cover all areas; the Local Council Center will give new license in another area.</p>	Sections 5, 7

8.5 Summary of consultation outcomes

The consultation outcomes revealed that:

- The interviews with the implemented companies revealed that, they are fully aware about security and safety procedures in accordance with the nature of the region.



- The AFD in cooperation with the European Union will provide the poor with a kind of grant to be able to install the NG (nearly 50% of the NG connection cost according to specific criteria). This initiative has been approved and will be applied to all project districts.
- The Ministry of Petroleum Initiative to encourage more people to connect NG by paying the cost in installment for 6 years at zero-interest rate
- The study recommended the participation of the community people in sharing information about NG project with the other people especially the illiterate groups. (the recommendation is not obligated for the project)
- There are many problems related to LPG cylinders such as: (high cost, price fluctuations, unavailable, the exerted effort to hold and install the cylinder, and the risks related to the existence of LPG cylinder within the household)
- The interviews and the focus group discussions revealed some concerns raised by the community regarding the NG connection such as:
 - o Actual need to provide clear information about the project and some concerns about NG security and safety.
 - o The majority of the community people cannot afford to pay NG installation costs in one installment, they strongly recommended to pay in installments.
 - o Some concerns about LPG security and safety.
 - o The community raised their concerns about the time plan and required approvals that remain as main barriers to install the NG in such areas.
 - o Actual need to response to grievances in timely manner
 - o All heads of municipalities attended various meetings expressed their support to install the NG to their areas. Such attitude is appreciated by Egypt Gas.

The key message from the consultation events carried out for this project is that Public and government acceptance for and support to the project are very strong.

8.6 ESMP disclosure

As soon as the site-specific ESMPs gets clearance from the World Bank and approval from EEAA, a final report will be published on the WB, EGAS and Egypt Gas websites. A copy of the ESMP report in English and a Summary in Arabic will be made available in the customer service office. Additionally, an Arabic summary will be made available in the contracting offices. An A3 poster will be installed in the contracting office informing about the results of the ESIA and the website link for the full ESMP study.